



# Integrated Climate Adaptation and Resiliency Program Technical Advisory Council Quarterly Meeting and Extreme Heat Public Workshop

## Meeting Minutes

March 26, 2021 | Zoom Video Conference | 9:30 AM – 4:30 PM

### Item 1 | Welcome and Roll Call

Present: Jacob Alvarez, Karalee Browne, Lori Nezhura (Alternate for Christina Curry), Grant Davis, Jana Ganion, Jason Greenspan, Amanda Hansen, Nuin-Tara Key, David Loya, Dan McDonald, Sona Mohnot, Darwin Moosavi, Andrea Ouse, Heather Rock, Yana Garcia, Mark Starr, Gloria Walton, John Wentworth.

Absent: Laura Engeman, Jonathan Parfrey, Michelle Passero, Brian Strong, Wilma Wooten.

### Item 2 | Approval of Draft Meeting Minutes

#### DISCUSSION

Nuin-Tara Key opened discussion for review of draft meeting minutes from the [12/11/2020](#) meeting.

#### ACTION

Councilmembers voted to approve draft meeting minutes from the December 11, 2020 meeting.

Motion: Jacob Alvarez, Second: John Wentworth.

Aye: Jacob Alvarez, Karalee Browne, Lori Nezhura, Grant Davis, Jana Ganion, Jason Greenspan, Amanda Hansen, Nuin-Tara Key, David Loya, Dan McDonald, Sona Mohnot, Darwin Moosavi, Andrea Ouse, Heather Rock, Yana Garcia, Mark Starr, Gloria Walton, John Wentworth.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

None.



### Item 3 | State Agency Report Outs

State partners provided updates on key adaptation priorities.

Darwin Moosavi (CalSTA):

- The draft Climate Action Plan for Transportation Infrastructure (CAPTI) is available for public feedback on the [CalSTA website](#) until May. This is CalSTA's implementation plan for [Executive Order N-19-19](#). The plan is directed to leverage state transportation dollars via an investment framework to support climate goals for resilience, adaptation, and GHG mitigation. There will be public workshops in April.

Lori Nezhura (CalOES):

- CalOES recently kicked off the state [Emergency Plan](#) update process. JR de la Rosa was recently hired as a Climate Science Advisor; he is charged with including adaptation within the Plan update.

Yana Garcia (CalEPA):

- CARB is kicking off the Climate Change [Scoping Plan](#) update process to consider how to reach the state's carbon neutrality targets, which includes the guidance from a recently launched environmental justice advisory committee.
- CalEPA also released an update to CalEnviroScreen recently through OEHHA; version 4.0 is [out for public comment](#), which now includes one new indicator focusing on the risk of childhood exposure to lead in older housing.
- The Water Board released [a report](#) in February looking at water rights analysis and permitting impacts related to climate change impacts. The Water Board is working on regional climate impacts and needs assessments related to the Safe and Affordable Drinking Water program.
- The Environmental Justice Small Grants [program](#) is soliciting applications, due in three months; this round is focusing on resiliency and recovery from the Covid-19 pandemic, and resilience in environmental justice communities.

Mark Starr (CDPH):

- CDPH is prioritizing equity and is employing equity metrics for the pandemic response for Covid-19 vaccines and test positivity. The Climate Change and Health Equity Section team has a [resource page](#) addressing climate impacts and Covid-19 guidance.
- CDPH is supporting the health equity goals, metrics and strategy updates to State Adaptation Strategy and prioritizing racial justice integration into everything including work addressing climate impacts. We have a monthly collaboration meeting with CalEPA. A recent focus of that group is advancing an equity frame across both agencies for resource allocation to people and places. We are analyzing the various assessment and adaptive capacity tools



that exist to inform this process including CalEnviroScreen, [Climate Change and Health Vulnerability Indicators](#), the [Healthy Places Index](#), and examining best uses and gaps of these tools.

- I also now sit on the Strategic Growth Council as the CDPH representative.
- We have a meeting on April 22, 3-5pm of the [Public Health Workgroup](#), a sub group of the Climate Action Team, which will focus on the health impacts of the CalSTA CAPTI update.
- We have a New Deputy Director for the Office of Health Equity, Dr. Rohan Radhakrishna, MD, MPH.

Amanda Hansen (CNRA):

- CNRA put together a significant package in the proposed governor's budget that would drive on climate resilience, including the water resilience portfolio and wildfire resilience.
- We're [implementing](#) the nature-based solutions Executive Order N-82-20, and hosting regional workshops this spring for feedback on how we might achieve the 30x30 goal (to conserve 30% of California's lands and coastal waters by 2030) and to understand how a climate smart lands strategy could support regional priorities, and to understand challenges and barriers.
- We recently released a [review of state actions](#) taken during the 2012-2016 drought and lessons learned.
- We are partnering with OPR and other state agencies to update the [State Adaptation Strategy](#).

Nuin-Tara Key (OPR):

- The State Adaptation Strategy update is a major priority for us.
- We are developing a Vulnerable Communities platform in partnership with the Greenlining Institute and the Asian Pacific Environmental Network.
- Kicked off a climate risk disclosure advisory group to develop recommendations for standardizing risk disclosure in finance and investment decisions.
- Continuing to bridge adaptation resilience work and long-term wildfire recovery and resilience efforts; we are finishing recruitment to staff this work and the vulnerable communities platform, made possible by a Hilton Foundation grant.
- OPR is leading a Just Transition roadmap in partnership with the Labor and Workforce Development agency as mandated by [Executive Order N-79-20](#).

## DISCUSSION

John Wentworth: Can you provide an update on the Covid-19 funding from the Federal American Rescue Plan; and is the State building new programs or will money only flow through existing programs?

Nuin-Tara Key: It's important to recognize that funding is for response and rescue and backfilling social safety net services, and is not designated for infrastructure or long term recovery expenditures.



Darwin Moosavi: California received \$900 million for CalTrans, divided 40% for local use and 60% for state use for State highway maintenance and operations.

Heather Rock: Lori, there is lots of press around oversubscription to the [FEMA BRIC Program](#). Has CalOES assessed how this process went and how to encourage the Biden administration to allocate more for the upcoming cycle, and get more funding to California?

Lori Nezhura: I will find out.

Nuin-Tara Key: As an FYI and tangentially related, we are considering how to create a pipeline to leverage state and federal dollars.

Jason Greenspan: Is there guidance in the CalSTA CAPTI draft document for counties that could help them evaluate projects through the lens of climate adaptation, such as timing, design, etc.?

Darwin Moosavi: This is front of mind for setting our direction and providing resources. Today we are posting an [FAQ](#) to help with some of those questions and what the document does and doesn't do. In terms of direct assistance, there are varied actions that touch on those topics.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

None received.

#### Item 4 | ICARP Updates

Juliette Finzi-Hart and Nikki Caravelli provided updates on the Adaptation Clearinghouse, FEMA Cooperative Technical Partners and Feasibility Study projects, Department of Insurance/ICARP insurance and planning primers, and resilience metrics development.

#### DISCUSSION

No discussion from Councilmembers.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Louis Blumberg: Can you describe what the Interagency Resilience Work Group is and its charge?

Juliette Finzi Hart: This is a standing meeting of representatives from state agencies who work on adaptation and resilience. The charge is to coordinate adaptation and resilience work across the state's agencies. Many representatives from this work group are on the call today.



## Item 5 | State Adaptation Strategy

Nuin-Tara Key and Amanda Hansen introduced the Administration's approach to the 2021 State Adaptation Strategy [update](#), coordinated by CNRA in partnership with OPR. OPR Executive Fellow Taylor Carnevale summarized survey and early feedback [results](#).

### QUESTIONS

Heather Rock (TAC Councilmember): These goals aren't set yet but will be defined through engagement over the next quarter

Nuin-Tara Key: yes.

Laurie Angel (Public attendee): How do you plan to hold agencies accountable to their plans?

Nuin-Tara Key: The strategy needs to be updated every three years and includes annual updates to the legislature. We will set up a structure for clear annual updates on progress towards meeting these priorities.

Craig Dremann: What will be the dollar ranges for grants? What time frame for each grant, one, two, three years?

Amanda Hansen: The Strategy is intended to drive how we invest on climate resilience. There is no grant money associated with this framework. The strategy should instead inform all state grants once released. As the strategy evolves, so will implications for grants.

### DISCUSSION

Nuin-Tara Key introduced key questions to frame Council discussion:

- 1) Do you see your work reflected? Are there major gaps that need to be addressed and brought in?
- 2) How do we work together in partnership across state to drive on these priorities?
- 3) How do we track our progress over time and develop clear metrics?

Michelle Passero: It's really important that we articulate somewhere via priority or principle that we need to be integrating climate mitigation with these strategies. We don't want to make the issue worse; there are a lot of opportunities to address climate writ large. Terminology can get in the way, so we should be explicit about mitigation as part of resilience, and show how these priorities can be integrated in planning and specific actions and projects and help us avoid harm and be more resilient long-term.

Nuin-Tara: From our perspective resilience does include mitigation, and there are both co-benefit opportunities and tradeoffs.



Mark Starr: I echo Michelle's comment. The wording of the public health priority (#2) could be broader than protecting public health and safety, especially in the event of climate disasters; it really could be ongoing impacts. I suggest something like "Protect and advance public health and safety in the context of climate change."

John Wentworth: I see the work I'm doing reflected in here. Some opportunities include using the TAC to work across the priorities and connect dots across disciplines and priorities, break down siloes, create alignment, and work across jurisdictions. What is the role of the federal government in this framework? We should leverage the shared stewardship agreement with the Forest Service and leverage the TAC to do cross-pollinating.

Jana Ganion: I echo earlier comments. Language matters: integration is more vague than greenhouse gas reductions or mitigation. We still have local and tribal governments who are still working on understanding the climate crisis lens. We've seen dramatic acceleration of the hazardous conditions created by the crisis. The more explicit we can be about pairing adaptation with mitigation, the better. We hope that by using that language, it will drive the carbon life cycle analysis tools as articulated in [EO B-30-15](#). We still don't have accessible, easy to use tools to conduct analysis on the carbon footprint of projects to make climate-smart, cost effective, immediate and long term-beneficial decisions. These tools will accelerate progress towards these goals, but it starts by pairing adaptation and mitigation together in every instance.

Heather Rock: I'm hearing a conflation between priorities, goals, and principles. We need to clarify this. A priority is strengthening protections for our communities, whereas a principle is using the best available climate science throughout this priority. In the structure, we need to be very specific; this should include specific types, quantities, and qualities, and specific deadlines.

Jason Greenspan: I see work I'm doing reflected here. As Mark said, I see the notion of climate disasters reflected in the public health priority, but we should not only emphasize disruptive events but also ongoing stressors and impacts on public health. On the priority to help nature adapt to climate change: avoid the maladaptive notion here and replace help with support, the wording of the first part does not feel right.

Amanda Hansen: Regarding suggestions from the chat around GIS tools, in our approach to 30x30 and the natural and working lands climate smart strategy, we are working with ESRI on a tool that will identify areas of opportunity to undertake conservation or other land management in a way that increases biodiversity and addresses equity. Our initial thinking is to use the downscaled fourth climate change assessment projections and future updates to help users visualize how climate change is expected to impact their region between now and 2100. I'm hopeful this tool can be supportive of the concerns raised in the chat.

Karalee Brown: My work is reflected in these priorities. We're running community-based outreach efforts around climate action plans and separate resilience plans. I echo



Mark's comment about expanding the second priority. We're finding that resilience and adaptation strategies create an opportunity to engage vulnerable communities and disadvantaged communities around daily experiences and health and safety issues. It's also a way to connect mitigation and adaptation together. On reducing climate risks to California's economy priority: daily health experiences are also affecting our economy.

Sona Mohnot: I appreciate the prioritization of strengthening protection for climate vulnerable communities. I'd like to see equity and environmental justice considerations de-siloed and distributed throughout the entire strategy and all sectors. Secondly, when discussing vulnerable populations, I encourage adding context about why communities are vulnerable in the first place, and how structural racism has led to climate inequities. Redlined communities are disproportionately exposed to climate threats. This strategy should connect the past to the present and create opportunities to reduce short-term vulnerabilities but also address the root causes. Finally, is there an overlap between the vulnerable communities mapping tool and the Strategy?

Nuin-Tara Key: It is our intent to make sure the processes for both are connected, but we're not able to give specifics on the timeline yet. Alongside CNRA, we don't want to create siloed tools and frameworks. That conversation on underlying inequities and structural root causes feeds into this and will inform the priorities and language.

Gloria Walton: I underscore what Sona, Mark, and Jason raised. I agree, and appreciate the language that Mark suggested around advancing and protecting public health and safety and making it broader. We can also add some language around proactive frames not just situated in the problem but also advancing solutions. We can add language around the democratization and localization of solutions, and reinforce being in partnership with local communities. Many communities are advancing these solutions already, we can elevate and uplift that. The two words about helping nature also need modification. I want to underscore the cross-pollination contribution from another Councilmember.

Nuin-Tara Key: On Rico and John's chat comments on the scale of investment needed to drive on these priorities: this is a huge question and focus. We are trying to take an all-of-government approach, both in terms of reducing emissions and addressing adaptation to build broader resilience. There can't just be one pot of funds: we need to integrate considerations into investments we're making every day. That is central to our approach.

Yana Garcia: Sona mentioned taking stock of ongoing ways structural racism persists. I'm sharing a [storymap](#) example of something that came out of Cal EPA's racial equity work on the persistence of disparities caused by the practice of redlining, how it intersects with environmental burdens and health vulnerability, and serves as an example of how we can pull those types of analyses together.



## PUBLIC COMMENT

Note: The public comments provided by Zoom chat are included in the appendix to the meeting minutes at the end of this document. Comments that were responded to verbally by ICARP Council members are included below.

Kim Springer: Can we leverage GIS mapping tools to locate the agriculture, the open space, the communities, and the infrastructure that are vulnerable/at risk to climate change and that present the highest priority for specific work. It seems overwhelming to consider all these initiatives for all communities in CA. Can the State target areas of the state for specific focus?

John Wentworth: Let me second the need for GIS tools especially to help the regions of the state, which I believe have yet to be defined. Very much looking forward to following up on the ESRI/GIS opportunities - we have been working with USFS/BLM/NPS on GIS challenges. ESRI has specific programs to work with Federal agencies.

Katie Patrick: Re GIS tools, we just created this [HD map of LA's urban heat island](#) with a new machine learning technique in cooperation with NASA. This is the highest resolution map available now, from the 2020 August heat wave.

Diane Foote: The Connecting Wildlands and Communities [project](#), funded by SGC, has been developing GIS data that might be useful too.

Rico Mastrodonato: I very much appreciate the work and commitment here to address adaptation. Moving the needle as urgently as needed will be dependent on meaningful, stable long-term investments to nature-based solutions. Bonds and GGRF are not dependable but seem to be our only current options for investing in natural resources. What is the state's plan or commitment to address this challenge?

Michelle Passero: Providing some examples of how to help nature adapt may help provide clarification. I think of fire risk reduction strategies and building connectivity for wildlife that may need to move to different locations due to climate change. Land use plays a key role.

Craig Dremann: Is your agency going to have funds to pay private ecological restoration consultants, to help form these plans? Or try to put all of these plans together, in-house?

Nuin-Tara Key: This is not a funding plan. It outlines overall priorities, how the state is taking action. No specific set of funding tied to specific grant programs. We do want to make sure that state investments are driving on these priorities.

James Waterman: I work for a vendor, SAS, that has the ability to bring the data together, to draw correlations together of work, through machine learning see how





everything connects and where it's going. Would love to bring data scientists to bring this together.

Nuin-Tara Key: We're happy to have a follow up on this, there are a number of efforts to bring together our data across the state.

Warner Chabot (SFEI): On the work with ESRI about mapping areas of priority focus and identifying DACs. Can you elaborate on the time frame, intentions and goals to complete mapping, and incorporating it into the strategy?

Nuin-Tara Key: The vulnerable communities platform will be an important tool to help us make decisions. We are not building it just to inform the strategy. It will be a tool that brings existing information together.

Amanda Hansen: The CA Nature tool is intended to be a place where conservation decisions or broader land management decisions can inform adaptation. We want to incorporate Nuin-Tara's tool and equity will overlap with these places to protect vulnerable communities. This is just step one, once the vulnerable communities platform is created, it will be reflected in CA Nature, which will be rolled out in the fall alongside a winter document release.

Nancy Thomas: How is the planned Vulnerable Communities Mapping Platform tool related to existing climate state resources like Cal-Adapt.org?

Nuin-Tara Key: The intent is to integrate data from existing sources, including Cal-Adapt; the platform is not looking to recreate a standalone resource. We want to bring information together so that it is in one place, and users don't have to go to a million different sites. We're looking to bring in Cal-Adapt, the Healthy Places Index, Regional Opportunities Index, and other datasets across the state into one place.

Heather Rock: As someone who uses Cal-Adapt, have we considered integrating social vulnerability into Cal-Adapt?

Nuin-Tara Key: Definitely a great question and an option on the table. One of the early steps is to build on the early work already completed.

John Wentworth: Tools can overwhelm the ability to take action.

Natalie Hernandez: I agree with Heather! Less places to go for mapping tools!

Nancy Thomas: Thanks Heather, it is definitely possible to pull this type of data into Cal-Adapt.

Natalie Hernandez: Less "new" tools or websites please and more integration. It's overwhelming for nonprofits.



Nuin-Tara Key: Natalie your sentiment is one of the central goals of this. We are looking to integrate existing tools into an integrated platform.

Craig Dremann: I do not detect either any carrot or any sticks for this plan—usually you need some kinds of economic incentives for people to adopt something new? Is something like that going to be built into this plan in the future?

Nuin-Tara Key: We are going to look at what it will take to drive on these priorities. Looking at previous iterations, it included long lists of state actions. Some of those actions were regulatory and financial incentives. We want to pull together higher level information, so that agencies can identify within their work how their departments can develop regulations and incentives.

Kim Springer: Locally, we are finding that carbon sequestration is likely the only way to "balance" remaining emissions, after all possible generation emissions are addressed, to achieve carbon neutrality. How will sequestration be integrated into the resilience work?

Amanda Hansen: The strategic work for the scoping plan involves nature-based solutions and achieving carbon neutrality. As others have discussed, we generally prioritize actions that can do both things.

Louis Blumberg: To what extent will you distinguish goals and actions to the various levels at which actions are implemented - state, regional, county, local and community?

Nuin-Tara Key: This is something we still need to figure out.

Katie Patrick: I'm curious as to the approach around the individual action.

Nuin-Tara Key: This strategy won't list individual actions but we want to create a way for individual actions to be aligned.

Craig Dremann: Is the State as part of this plan, ever going to tax Carbon, or like Sachi Lloyd's book "The Carbon Diaries 2015" put everyone on a carbon diet?

Heather Rock: The state does tax carbon via its cap and trade program.

Craig Dremann: Today, California is experiencing the third worst drought in State history, my local creek has only flowed for one day, when it should be flowing from October to May—are you moving this plan fast enough, so we can actually turn this Global warming issue around in time?

Nuin-Tara Key: We need to balance urgency for action for disaster events, but also address at the same time chronic longer-term impacts, adaptation and resilience solutions.



Kim Springer: Could the State produce GHG emission inventories, based on the protocols that local governments use, to produce emission inventories for all the cities in the state? This would produce a map of emissions that I don't think exists, and release local government staff resources to focus on implementation. The State has the waste, energy, and transportation DMV data (which is so underutilized), and maybe even the water data.

Nuin-Tara Key: We will keep the State Adaptation Strategy working in parallel with the CARB scoping plan effort.

Heather Hickerson: We will be working together very closely on these two policies.

Michelle Passero: I think a big gap is helping people, institutions, local governments understand how to think about integrating actions to address the range of climate issues (from mitigation to protecting against impacts).

Nuin-Tara Key: Agreed, that's also an important role that ICARP plays in helping identify, in addition to the State Strategy, how do we provide the tools, resources and technical assistance to help communities be able to implement what is in these strategies and frameworks.

Nuin-Tara Key: As a summary of key themes, I heard:

- Make sure we're modeling an integrated and coordinated approach in terms of how we're building this Strategy;
- Recognize the importance of working across scales, recognizing federal partners and scale of land management in the state;
- Feedback on the second priority around public health, explicit actions around climate vulnerable communities, and carrying equity and environmental justice throughout, not as standalone issue/priority;
- Think through different adjustments to the "Help nature adapt" language
- Make sure we're driving towards a solutions space; that the priorities are proactive rather than reactive.

John Wentworth: I posit the idea of a workshop format with this group to do a cross-pollination/silo-breaking down conversation.

## **Item 6 | Public Workshop: Listening Session on Extreme Heat**

Geri Gero and Jacob Alvarez presented local case studies on extreme heat. Nuin-Tara Key and Amanda Hansen introduced key discussion questions to facilitate breakout sessions. A summary of the extreme heat workshop findings is under development and will inform future extreme heat workshops throughout summer / fall 2021.

## **Item 7 | General Public Comment**



Rico Mastrodonato: Put funding in the May Budget Revise to take action and signify the importance of this issue, don't wait until a Climate Resilience Bond to fund things in 2023.

## **Item 8 | Closing, Future Agenda Items, and Meeting Adjourned**



## Meeting Notes Appendix: Public Comments from Zoom Chat

### Item 3: State Agency Updates

09:53:10 From Juliette Finzi-Hart, OPR (she/her) to Everyone :  
<https://calsta.ca.gov/subject-areas/climate-action-plan>

09:54:34 From \* Yana Garcia (TAC) to Everyone : Waterboard report link:  
[https://www.waterboards.ca.gov/waterrights/water\\_issues/programs/climate\\_change/](https://www.waterboards.ca.gov/waterrights/water_issues/programs/climate_change/)

09:56:12 From Linda Helland, she/her, CDPH to Everyone : Equity Metric that Mark Starr is speaking of: [https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CID/DCDC/Pages/COVID-19/CaliforniaHealthEquityMetric.aspx?TSPD\\_101\\_R0=087ed344cfab200060ddb38963d4facd7160638a611b5dccccd876355c4a8f083da28bca03bc34a10897611063143000e7c6bd594f8c983a30a2185b3b715acc703ea502528a792371e5f65b31c7d803b4b26bb00ab07678fdb2bc04072c5519](https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CID/DCDC/Pages/COVID-19/CaliforniaHealthEquityMetric.aspx?TSPD_101_R0=087ed344cfab200060ddb38963d4facd7160638a611b5dccccd876355c4a8f083da28bca03bc34a10897611063143000e7c6bd594f8c983a30a2185b3b715acc703ea502528a792371e5f65b31c7d803b4b26bb00ab07678fdb2bc04072c5519)

09:58:17 From Linda Helland, she/her, CDPH to Everyone : Health Equity Playbook for Communities: <https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CID/DCDC/Pages/COVID-19/COVID-19-Equity-Technical-Assistance-Playbook.aspx>

09:58:42 From Nicole Hernandez to Everyone :  
<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/resources/documents/california-climate-investments-investment-plan>

09:59:54 From Linda Helland, she/her, CDPH to Everyone :  
<https://oehha.ca.gov/calenviroscreen>

10:00:51 From Linda Helland, she/her, CDPH to Everyone : Climate Change and Health Vulnerability Indicators for California: <https://skylab.cdph.ca.gov/CCHVlz/>

10:01:20 From Linda Helland, she/her, CDPH to Everyone : Healthy Places Index  
<https://healthyplacesindex.org>

10:02:28 From Linda Helland, she/her, CDPH to Everyone : For info about Public Health Workgroup of Climate Action Team:  
<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/resources/documents/climate-action-team-public-health-workgroup-meetings>

10:04:28 From Nicole Hernandez to Everyone :  
<https://resources.ca.gov/Initiatives/Expanding-Nature-Based-Solutions>

10:06:06 From Nicole Hernandez to Everyone :  
<https://resources.ca.gov/Initiatives/Building-Climate-Resilience>

10:07:04 From \* Amanda Hansen (TAC) to Everyone : Drought report -  
<https://secretary.resources.ca.gov/2021/03/learning-from-the-last-drought/>



10:09:57 From Nicole Hernandez to Everyone : justtransition:  
<https://www.opr.ca.gov/economic-development/>

#### Item 4: ICARP Updates

10:23:49 From Nicole Hernandez to Everyone : <https://resilientca.org/>

10:24:10 From Nicole Hernandez to Everyone : adaptation planning guide  
<https://resilientca.org/apg/>

10:24:51 From \* Lori Nezhura (TAC, Cal OES) to Everyone : Building Resilient Infrastructure and Communities (BRIC) grant program: <https://www.caloes.ca.gov/cal-oes-divisions/hazard-mitigation/pre-disaster-flood-mitigation>

#### Item 5: State Adaptation Strategy Update

10:45:47 From Michelle Passero to Everyone : As we pursue these priorities, it'll be important to ensure we are integrating climate mitigation into these actions so we don't make it harder to be resilient and adapt. Might be good to be explicit about this.

10:47:43 From \* Mark Starr (TAC) to Everyone : Perhaps a broader PH priority. Something like "Protect and advance public health and safety in the context of climate change"?

10:50:41 From \* Heather Rock (she/her, TAC) to Everyone : just to be clear: these goals aren't set yet but will be defined through engagement over the next quarter?

10:51:18 From Laurie Angel to Everyone : How do you plan to hold agencies accountable to their plans?

10:51:19 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : 1.) what will be the dollar ranges for grants? 2.) what time frame for each grant, one, two, three years?

10:53:02 From Laurie Angel to Everyone : Tie funding to goals only.

10:55:20 From Nicole Hernandez to Everyone : summary document of survey results:  
[https://opr.ca.gov/meetings/tac/2021-03-26/docs/20210326-Item5\\_FirstSurveyResults\\_Summary.pdf](https://opr.ca.gov/meetings/tac/2021-03-26/docs/20210326-Item5_FirstSurveyResults_Summary.pdf)

11:00:31 From \* Jana Ganion (TAC) to Everyone : I agree with Michelle. Adaptation language should always be paired with explicit mitigation language, so that our strategies don't make the underlying causes of climate change worse. We have done a lot of work to try to pair those two together, which of course leads to the analysis tools we need to easily calculate the carbon lifecycle analysis for individual projects for climate-smart (and therefore more cost-effective over time) decision-making, in alignment with the broader goals.



11:08:29 From \* John Wentworth (TAC) to Everyone :  
<https://www.gov.ca.gov/2020/08/13/california-u-s-forest-service-establish-shared-long-term-strategy-to-manage-forests-and-rangelands/>

11:08:40 From \* John Wentworth (TAC) to Everyone : <https://www.calrecvision.org>

11:09:43 From \* John Wentworth (TAC) to Everyone :  
[https://mltpa.org/images/downloads/025\\_34\\_CalRecVision\\_Final\\_2021\\_WEB.pdf](https://mltpa.org/images/downloads/025_34_CalRecVision_Final_2021_WEB.pdf)

11:12:49 From Kim Springer to Everyone : Can we leverage GIS mapping tools to locate the agriculture, the open space, the communities, the infrastructure, .... that are vulnerable/at risk to climate change and that present the highest priority for specific work. It seems overwhelming to consider all these initiatives for all communities in CA. Can the State target areas of the state for specific focus?

11:13:53 From \* John Wentworth (TAC) to Everyone : Let me second the need for GIS tools especially to help the regions of the state, which I believe have yet to be defined....?

11:17:28 From \* John Wentworth (TAC) to Everyone : Very much looking forward to following up on the ESRI/GIS opportunities - we have been working with USFS/BLM/NPS on GIS challenges - ESRI has specific programs to work with Federal agencies, looking forward to following up

11:19:01 From Katie Patrick to Everyone : Re GIS tools, we just created this HD map of LA's urban heat island with a new machine learning technique in cooperation with NASA. This is the highest resolution map available now, from August heat wave 2020  
<https://bit.ly/31xpviU>

11:19:40 From Rico Mastrodonato to Everyone : I very much appreciate the work and commitment here to address adaptation. Moving the needle as urgently as needed will be dependent on meaningful, stable long-term investments to nature-based solutions. Bonds and GGRF are not dependable but seem to be our only current options for investing in natural resources. What is the state's plan or commitment to address this challenge?

11:20:35 From \* Yana Garcia (TAC) to Everyone :  
<https://storymaps.arcgis.com/stories/f167b251809c43778a2f9f040f43d2f5>

11:22:33 From \* John Wentworth (TAC) to Everyone : Rico's comment is super important - needs to be addressed by the ICARP TAC

11:23:08 From \* John Wentworth (TAC) to Everyone : ... and the State especially given the new Climate Bond that is moving forward



11:25:56 From Diane Foote to Everyone : The Connecting Wildlands and Communities project <https://www.climatealliance.org/cwc>, funded by SGC, has been developing GIS data that might be useful too.

11:26:58 From Michelle Passero, The Nature Conservancy (TAC) to Everyone : Providing some examples of how to help nature adapt may help provide clarification. I think of fire risk reduction strategies and building connectivity for wildlife that may need to move to different locations due to climate change. Land use plays a key role.

11:27:13 From Chuck Mills to Everyone : Rico is 100% on target here. NR investments need to go beyond bonds

11:27:45 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : Is your agency going to have funds to pay private ecological restoration consultants, to help form these plans? Or try to put all of these plans together, in-house?

11:32:55 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : NEXT - Yes, but the professionals in the field, might bring some real-life examples, that could be included in your plans?

11:34:37 From Nancy Thomas to Everyone : How is the planned Vulnerable Communities Mapping Platform tool related to existing climate state resources like Cal-Adapt.org? (feel free to read and respond)

11:39:39 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : NEXT—Please read and answer—I do not detect either any CARROT or any STICKS for this plan—usually you need some kinds of economic incentives for people to adopt something new? Is something like that going to be built into this plan in the future?

11:40:18 From Natalie Hernandez to Everyone : I also have that question, same as Nancy.

11:41:12 From Louis Blumberg to Everyone : To what extent will you distinguish goals and actions to the various levels at which actions are implemented - state, regional, county, local and community?

11:41:32 From Kim Springer to Everyone : Locally, we are finding that Sequestration is likely the only way to "balance" remaining emissions, after all possible generation emissions are addressed, to achieve carbon neutrality. How will sequestration be integrated into the resilience work?

11:41:43 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : Is the State as part of this plan, ever going to tax Carbon, or like Saci Lloyd's book "The Carbon Diaries 2015" put everyone on a carbon diet?

11:44:21 From Natalie Hernandez to Everyone : I agree with Heather! Less places to go for mapping tools!





11:44:49 From Nancy Thomas to Everyone : Thanks Heather, it is definitely possible to pull this type of data into Cal-Adapt

11:45:44 From \* Heather Rock (she/her, TAC) to Everyone : when we have too many tools and places to go then we end up needing to spend time and resources to consolidate them for use

11:45:59 From Natalie Hernandez to Everyone : Less "new" tools or website please. More integration. It's overwhelming for nonprofits.

11:48:15 From John Melvin to Everyone : The low hanging fruit are multi-benefit solutions that already have the tools and plans to take action. Those do exist now.

11:51:13 From Chuck Mills to Everyone : And given that, as others have noted today, we are living in climate change, Staff Chief Melvin's observation to support the actionable low-hanging fruit now makes perfect sense.

11:51:45 From Laurie Angel to Everyone : Agencies have nuts and bolts. Not at the state level

11:53:42 From Rachel Couch to Everyone : Hi Katie, Ecology Action (ED Kirsten Liske) is leading a group on individual and community action in the Central Coast with groups like the SLO Climate Coalition and Central Coast Climate Collaborative (4C).

11:53:56 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : Is the State as part of this plan, ever going to tax Carbon, or like Saci Lloyd's book "The Carbon Diaries 2015" put everyone in California on a carbon diet?

11:54:31 From Rico Mastrodonato to Everyone : To Staff Chief Melvin's comment - Urban Greening and Urban Forestry come to mind as multi-benefit, successful, low-hanging fruit. One is funded at \$23m over 2-fiscal years, the other is not currently being proposed for funding.

11:55:44 From \* Heather Rock (she/her, TAC) to Everyone : @ Craig: the state does tax carbon via its cap and trade program

11:57:13 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : Today, California is experiencing the third worst drought in State history, my local creek has only flowed for one day, when it should be flowing from October to May—are you moving this plan fast enough, so we can actually turn this Global warming issue around in time?

11:57:13 From Kim Springer to Everyone : Could the State produce GHG emission inventories, based on the protocols that local governments use, to produce emission inventories for all the cities in the state? This would produce a map of emissions that I don't think exists, and release local government staff resources to focus on implementation. The State has the waste, energy, and transportation DMV data (which is so underutilized), and maybe even the water data.



11:59:51 From \* Michelle Passero, The Nature Conservancy (TAC) to Everyone : I think a big gap is helping people, institutions, local governments understand how to think about integrate actions to address the range of climate issues (from mitigation to protecting against impacts)

12:00:38 From maurice Roos to Everyone : Folks should recognize that higher temps increase water needs for vegetation, trees and animals particularly in hot spells.

12:04:48 From Louis Blumberg to Everyone : Yes, agree with Maurice that hot spells are particularly problematic.

12:05:17 From Louis Blumberg to Everyone : For people too!

#### Item 6: Public Workshop: Listening Session on Extreme Heat and Urban Greening

13:51:43 From Rico Mastrodonato to Everyone : It's alarming enough to see 147- degrees on parking lot at Santa Anita, these would be similar temps for school playgrounds in most of CA which is even more alarming. State should really start examining systematically greening public school yards where the state already owns the land. Like LAUSD

13:53:31 From John Melvin to Everyone : Absolutely right Rico. We've got to get those dark surfaces shaded or otherwise mitigated.

13:55:06 From Rico Mastrodonato to Everyone : The at-risk populations for COVID, are the exact same populations at-risk from heat

13:55:19 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : What if the State invested in free solar panel on every roof, that would shade the roof, and bring us closer to being carbon neutral? That is what I am suggesting for the one million homes and commercial building in the cities of Libya? Solar panels on every roof, solves two major problems?

13:57:13 From John Melvin to Everyone : Solar panels should be in the mix, but are not really a multiple benefit solution when on every home. They then become prohibitive of tree canopy expansion, which has many other benefits associated with it. Better to concentrate solar panels on places that cannot otherwise be mitigated - like warehouse roofs as an example.

13:59:38 From \* Mark Starr (TAC) to Everyone : Curious about who/what the "health institute" rep. on the Adv. Comm. might be?

14:00:51 From Katie Patrick to Everyone : Here's a short presentation of LA's white streets project we recorded if anyone wants to learn more <https://youtu.be/TVJlIttyQl6U>

14:00:56 From Kristen Torres Pawling to Everyone : so hot pink on the map meant high exposure and high sensitivity



14:01:53 From Linda Helland, she/her, CDPH to Everyone : Public Health Alliance of Southern California?

14:03:07 From Sharon Sand to Everyone : LA County has a free tree program too (re. urban forestry) - homeowners can request a tree be planted in the parkway in front of their home

14:03:26 From Craig Dremann to Everyone : Why not start to cool Los Angeles, with the commercial roofs at the core directly south of downtown Los Angeles, with solar panels within the boundaries of 110, 101 and 60, that could be the "low hanging fruit" and on Google Earth, do not see a single solar panel on any of those roofs, right where the electricity is needed too?

14:04:10 From Kristen Torres Pawling to Everyone : confirming that "health institute" on our slide references Prevention Institute. thanks Linda. PHASC isn't on our Advisory Committee.

14:05:21 From Kimberly Guo to Everyone : Sharon, could you please share a link about LA County's free tree program? I'm with City Plants, which provides free trees in LA City, and we often get questions from folks in LA County.

14:07:02 From Sharon Sand to Everyone :  
<https://pw.lacounty.gov/rmd/parkwaytrees/TreePlanting.aspx>

14:13:58 From Rico Mastrodonato to Everyone : The state has only 2-nature based climate programs, Urban Greening and Urban Forestry. The Administration has proposed not to fund Resource Agency Urban Greening Program in 2021-22. With science informing how immediate the danger from heat is, and the overwhelming success of the program (over-subscribed by 5-10X every solicitation). Can you help us understand the thinking behind that decision?

14:14:27 From Rico Mastrodonato to Everyone : Climate programs that address heat, to clarify

14:16:25 From Sharon Sand to Everyone : Excellent presentations, how can we make sure all urban areas in California have access to a complete urban tree canopy

14:18:15 From John Melvin to Everyone : Sharon, by focusing on areas that lack tree canopy the most and by working hard to get more tree friendly local policies and ordinances.

14:18:18 From Chuck Mills to Everyone : Raise your voices to your local, regional and state decision makers to support the state two programs highlighted here with the robust fiscal resources necessary to get ahead of this human health issue.



14:18:36 From Jack Liebster to Everyone : Can either of our speakers (or those in the audience) identify anyone who is at the leading edge of doing this problem-analytical solution alternative work in Northern/ Coastal California?

14:19:38 From Kimmy Boyle to Everyone : Could Gary Gero talk more about how LA was able to implement the 'cool roof' ordinance and how that helped drive the market towards these solutions? How can we formulate more policies that incentivize these low cost- effective solutions?

14:20:03 From Jack Liebster to Everyone : Is there a conflict between adding trees for shading homes and defensible space?

14:20:29 From suzanne marr to Everyone : Jack I have wondered about that too.

14:20:57 From John Melvin to Everyone : Jack, there can be, but not when the best management practices are followed. It is about species selection and spacing, along with good maintenance practices.

14:21:32 From \* Heather Rock (she/her, TAC) to Everyone : I imagine there could be some thoughts on options for cooling communities that may differ whether or not in a high fire threat district or not. eg, need defensible space in an HFTD zone; urban areas with limited/no fire risk can use different solutions

14:22:37 From \* Jonathan Parfrey (TAC) to Everyone : <https://www.treepeople.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/LAUCC-Rx-for-Hot-Cities-Infographic.pdf>

14:27:01 From Laurie Angel to Everyone : Air quality is a major issue - in Long Beach we have 4 freeways through our city, including major port and commuter traffic. All kinds of industry. Very difficult to commit to open space when monetizing land is such a fiscal need for cities.

14:28:24 From Jack Liebster to Everyone : Re gradually increasing temperatures- some kind of metric for how heat increases probability of catastrophic fire endanger citizens directly of through polluted air.